

A Guide to Selecting and Applying Evidence-Based Practices to English Language Acquisition Programs

USDE guidance defines four levels of evidence for evaluating the strength of evidence indicating the effectiveness of a given program or intervention. These range from “Strong Evidence” to “Demonstrates a Rationale.” Throughout this guide, these levels of evidence will be referred to as “Tier 1,” “Tier 2,” etc. as shown in the table below.

Tier	Level of Evidence	Description
1	Strong Evidence	Supported by one or more well-designed and well-implemented randomized control experimental studies .
2	Moderate Evidence	Supported by one or more well-designed and well-implemented quasi-experimental studies .
3	Promising Evidence	Supported by one or more well-designed and well-implemented correlational studies .
4	Demonstrates a Rationale	Practices that have a well-defined logic model or theory of action , are supported by research, and have some effort underway to determine their effectiveness.

The Tables below are organized into four areas of activity:

1. Program Planning
2. Classroom Strategies
3. Professional Development
4. Extended Learning Settings
5. Eligible Interventions

English Language Acquisition Programs/Interventions and Levels of Evidence

1. Program Planning

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Offer long-term bilingual programs for English learners. <i>Long-term math and English/language arts outcomes are highest for English Learners in bilingual programs. English learners in dual language programs far outperform English learners in other programs. Effective programs must be sustained and consistent.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12 PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 1, Strong Source: Valentino, R., Reardon, S. (2015) "Effectiveness of Four Instructional Programs Designed to Serve English Language Learners: Variation by Ethnicity and Initial English Proficiency." <i>Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis</i> (vol. 37, no. 4). https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.3102/0162373715573310 Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Source: Howard, E. R., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., Rogers, D., Olague, N., Medina, J., Kennedy, B., Sugarman, J., & Christian, D. (2018). <i>Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education (3rd ed.)</i>. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. http://www.cal.org/resource-center/publications-products/gp3-pdf
Develop clear policies, guidelines and data-tracking systems to monitor student progress toward English language proficiency. <i>Policies and practices should include multiple types of data sources and should be reviewed by a diverse range of stakeholders and experts. There should be an alignment between special education and English language programs, practices, and systemic data collection and tracking.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Source: Burr, E., Haas, E., & Ferriere, K. (2015). <i>Identifying and Supporting English Learner Students with Learning Disabilities: Key issues in the literature and state practice</i> (REL 2015–086). Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance, Regional Educational Laboratory West. https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/west/pdf/REL_2015086.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Create a school-wide vision of bilingualism, biliteracy and multiculturalism through effective, engaged leadership and staff. <i>Creation of a shared vision will set a foundation for bilingualism and biliteracy, increase buy-in among school community stakeholders, and support the long-term programming that leads to the most effective bilingual and biliterate outcomes for students.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Howard, E. R., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., Rogers, D., Olague, N., Medina, J., Kennedy, B., Sugarman, J., & Christian, D. (2018). <i>Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education</i> (3rd ed.). Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. http://www.cal.org/resource-center/publications-products/gp3-pdf
Fill content area gaps with appropriate instruction and basic literacy development adapted for English learners. <i>Newcomer programs can help to mitigate the challenges of addressing content gaps and basic English literacy needs for English learners that arrive later in their education. By providing targeted supports through newcomer programs, the very specific needs of these students can be addressed in order to provide a foundation for more advanced secondary coursework and to enable students to graduate.</i>	6-8 9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: Short, D. J., & Boyson, B. A. (2012). <i>Helping Newcomer Students Succeed in Secondary Schools and Beyond</i>. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. https://www.carnegie.org/media/filer_public/ff/fd/ffda48e-4211-44c5-b4ef-86e8b50929d6/ccny_report_2012_helping.pdf
Use progress monitoring. <i>Closely monitor student progress and proactively intervene if students begin to show that there are challenges with attendance, behavior, or academics.</i>	9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Provide intensive, individualized supports for students that have fallen off track. <i>When students need intensive supports, identify a single individual to be each student's primary advocate, provide a range of support options that can be used to assist students, and help advocates by providing ongoing professional learning and tracking tools.</i>	9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf
Engage students through curricula and programs that connect with college and career success. <i>Connect schoolwork to students' options after high school and provide curricula and programs that help students build supportive relationships. Assess student engagement to identify areas for improvement, and intervene with students who are not meaningfully engaged.</i>	9-12	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf
Create small, personalized communities to facilitate monitoring and support. <i>Build teams of teachers that share groups of students, and provide common planning time and opportunities for staff to collaborate and support students. Identify a theme to help build a strong sense of community and foster student engagement.</i>	9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

2. Classroom Strategies

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Conduct formative assessments to use with English Learners to determine which students need additional support. <i>Formative assessments should measure phonological processing, letter knowledge, and word and text reading.</i>	PreK-3 4-5	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in the Elementary Grades</i> (NCEE 2007-4001) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/20074011.pdf
Provide focused, intensive small-group interventions for English learners determined to be at risk for reading problems. <i>The interventions should include phonological awareness, phonics, reading fluency, vocabulary, and comprehension and be delivered through explicit, direct instruction.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12 PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in the Elementary Grades</i> (NCEE 2007-4001) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/20074011.pdf Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Teaching Academic Content and Literacy to English Learners in Elementary and Middle School</i> (NCEE 2014-4012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Doc/practiceguide/english_learners_pg_040114.pdf Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Prioritize academic vocabulary instruction. <i>Provide high-quality vocabulary instruction throughout the day, and teach vocabulary learning strategies and essential content words in detail; teach a set of academic vocabulary intensively over multiple days.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12 PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12 PreK-3 4-5 6-8	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in the Elementary Grades</i> (NCEE 2007-4001) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/20074011.pdf Tier 1, Strong Source: Carlo, M., August, D., McLaughlin, B., Snow, C., Dressler, C., Lippman, D., Lively, T., White, Cl., (2004). "Closing the gap: Addressing the vocabulary needs of English-language learners in bilingual and mainstream classrooms." <i>Reading Research Quarterly</i>, (vol. 39, no. 2). https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ684719 Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Teaching Academic Content and Literacy to English Learners in Elementary and Middle School</i> (NCEE 2014-4012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/practiceguide/english_learners_pg_040114.pdf
Provide at least 90 minutes a week for English Learners to work collaboratively with others. <i>This time should be devoted to activities in which pairs of students at different ability levels or different English language proficiencies work together on academic tasks to practice and extend new content.</i>	PreK-3 4-5	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in the Elementary Grades</i> (NCEE 2007-4001) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/20074011.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Ensure that the development of academic English is a key instructional goal for English Learners. <i>Provide curricula to accompany core reading and mathematics series, and support the implementation of the curricula through effective professional development.</i>	PreK-3 4-5	Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Effective Literacy and English Language Instruction for English Learners in the Elementary Grades</i> (NCEE 2007-4001) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/20074011.pdf
Use literature logs and oral academic language. <i>Develop independent literature logs and have students engage in discussions to make connections and enhance understanding.</i>	PreK-3 4-5	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>What Works Clearinghouse Intervention Report Instructional Conversations and Literature Logs</i> (Rep.). (2006) Retrieved from What Works Clearinghouse. https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/InterventionReports/WWC_ICLL_102606.pdf
Integrate oral and written English language instruction into content instruction. <i>Use visual instructional tools to anchor instruction and help make content comprehensible. Provide daily opportunities for students to talk about content in pairs or small groups, and use writing opportunities to extend student learning and understanding of new content.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Teaching Academic Content and Literacy to English Learners in Elementary and Middle School</i> (NCEE 2014-4012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/practiceguide/english_learners_pg_040114.pdf
Provide ongoing, structured opportunities to develop writing skills in English. <i>Offer writing assignments that are anchored in content and provide language-based supports to facilitate writing. Provide opportunities to collaborate in small groups about aspects of writing. Review student writing and provide constructive feedback.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8	Tier 3, Promising Source: <i>Teaching Academic Content and Literacy to English Learners in Elementary and Middle School</i> (NCEE 2014-4012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/practiceguide/english_learners_pg_040114.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Fill content area gaps with appropriate instruction and basic literacy development adapted for English Learners. <i>Newcomer programs can help to mitigate the challenges of addressing content gaps and basic English literacy needs for English learners that arrive later in their education. By providing targeted supports through newcomer programs, the very specific needs of these students can be addressed in order to provide a foundation for more advanced secondary coursework and to enable students to graduate.</i>	6-8 9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: Short, D. J., & Boyson, B. A. (2012). <i>Helping newcomer students succeed in secondary schools and beyond</i>. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. https://www.carnegie.org/media/filer_public/ff/fd/fffda48e-4211-44c5-b4ef-86e8b50929d6/ccny_report_2012_helping.pdf
Offer long-term bilingual programs for English learners. <i>Long-term math and English/language arts outcomes are highest for English learners in bilingual programs. English learners in dual language programs far outperform English learners in other programs. Effective programs are sustained and consistent.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 1, Strong Source: Valentino, R., Reardon, S. (2015) "Effectiveness of Four Instructional Programs Designed to Serve English Language Learners: Variation by Ethnicity and Initial English Proficiency." <i>Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis</i> (vol. 37, no. 4). https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.3102/0162373715573310
Provide intensive, individualized supports for students that have fallen off track. <i>When students need intensive supports, identify a single individual to be each student's primary advocate, provide a range of support options that can be used to assist students, and help advocates by providing ongoing professional learning and tracking tools.</i>	9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Engage students through curricula and programs that connect with college and career success. <i>Connect schoolwork to students' options after high school and provide curricula and programs that help students build supportive relationships. Assess student engagement to identify areas for improvement, and intervene with students who are not meaningfully engaged.</i>	9-12	Tier 1, Strong Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf
Use progress monitoring. <i>Closely monitor student progress and proactively intervene if students begin to show that there are challenges with attendance, behavior, or academics.</i>	9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: <i>Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools</i> (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf
Integrate long-term English learners into the school community and offer supports. <i>Provide access to rigorous and relevant curriculum and relationships with supportive adults.</i>	9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: <i>Effective Interventions for Long-Term English Learners</i> (2017). Washington DC: Hanover House https://portal.ct.gov/-/media/SDE/ESSA%20Evidence%20Guides/Effective_Interventions_for_Long-Term_English_Learners

3. Professional Development

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Ensure that teachers of English Learners receive specialized training in language education pedagogy, materials and resources. <i>Training should address such topics as educational pedagogy, equity pedagogy, biliteracy development and implementation of the language program model, standards-based teaching, literacy instruction, sheltered instruction, and parental and community involvement as well as specific concepts of English literacy development, such as oral language development, vocabulary development, and meaning-based phonemic and phonetic work.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Source: Howard, E. R., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., Rogers, D., Olague, N., Medina, J., Kennedy, B., Sugarman, J., & Christian, D. (2018). <i>Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education</i> (3rd ed.). Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. http://www.cal.org/resource-center/publications-products/gp3-pdf
Provide high-quality professional development on bilingual education, dual language programs and effective instructional strategies. <i>It is imperative that teachers are trained in second language and biliteracy development so they understand how languages are learned and incorporate this into their practice. To support their students' acquisition of language and literacy, teachers must use content pedagogy methods and choose strategies that fit with the goals and needs of dual language students, and training is important to familiarize teachers with these concepts.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Source: Howard, E. R., Lindholm-Leary, K. J., Rogers, D., Olague, N., Medina, J., Kennedy, B., Sugarman, J., & Christian, D. (2018). <i>Guiding Principles for Dual Language Education</i> (3rd ed.). Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. http://www.cal.org/resource-center/publications-products/gp3-pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Careful staffing and professional development are imperative for effective newcomer programs. <i>Programs should be staffed by committed teachers that are specially trained to teach newcomers and have ESL or bilingual credentials or endorsements as well as professionals that can provide wraparound supports. Professional development should be provided to newcomer program staff.</i>	6-9 9-12	Tier 3, Promising Source: Short, D. J., & Boyson, B. A. (2012). <i>Helping newcomer students succeed in secondary schools and beyond</i>. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics. https://www.carnegie.org/media/filer_public/ff/fd/fffda48e-4211-44c5-b4ef-86e8b50929d6/ccny_report_2012_helping.pdf

4. Extended Learning Settings

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Adapt instruction to individual and small group needs. <i>Focus should be placed on supplementing learning from the school day and providing targeted assistance to students whose needs extend beyond what is available through classroom instruction. Student performance may be positively impacted by close alignment of the content and pacing of instruction, and identifying the right level of instruction and pace is imperative for effective individualized instruction.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: Structuring Out-of-School Time to Improve Academic Achievement (NCEE 2009-012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/ost_pg_072109.pdf
Assess program performance and use the results to improve the quality of the program. <i>Both formative and summative evaluations are instrumental in any program improvement effort. Programs should have internal mechanisms to monitor staff performance, collect data related to program implementation, and conduct independent evaluations of program implementation and student impact.</i>	PreK-3 4-5 6-8 9-12	Tier 4, Demonstrates a Rationale Source: Structuring Out-of-School Time to Improve Academic Achievement (NCEE 2009-012) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/ost_pg_072109.pdf
Provide intensive, individualized support to students who have fallen off track and face significant challenges to success. <i>When students need intensive supports, identify a single individual to be each student's primary advocate, provide a range of support options that can be used to assist students, and help advocates by providing ongoing professional learning and tracking tools.</i>	9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Create small, personalized communities to facilitate monitoring and support of at-risk students. <i>Build teams of teachers that share groups of students, and provide common planning time and opportunities for staff to collaborate and support students. Identify a theme to help build a strong sense of community and foster student engagement.</i>	9-12	Tier 2, Moderate Source: Preventing Dropout in Secondary Schools (NCEE 2017-4028) https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/wwc/Docs/PracticeGuide/wwc_dropout_092617.pdf

5. Eligible Interventions*

* The curricula listed in the table below are considered “Evidence-Based Interventions” and are therefore eligible for support with Federal Funds. This list is for informative purposes only. Inclusion in this list does not represent an endorsement on the part of the State of Oklahoma or any of its agencies, nor is this list to be considered exhaustive.

Evidence-Based Practice and Rationale	Grade Band	Level of Evidence and Source
Fast ForWord <i>A computer-based reading program intended to help students develop and strengthen cognitive skills necessary for successful reading and learning.</i>	K-10 (studies refer to use with students K-3)	Tier 2, Moderate What Works Clearinghouse Intervention Report: Fast ForWord (ed.gov)
Bilingual Cooperative Integrative Reading and Composition (BCIRC) <i>The Bilingual Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (BCIRC) program is an adaptation of the Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) program designed to help Spanish-speaking students succeed in reading Spanish and then making a successful transition to English reading.</i>	2-5 (studies refer to use with students 2-3)	Tier 2, Moderate What Works Clearinghouse Intervention Report: Bilingual Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition
Vocabulary Improvement Program for English Language Learners and Their Classmates (VIP) <i>VIP is a vocabulary development curriculum for English language learners and native English speakers. 15-week program including 30-45-minute whole class and group activities, target vocabulary and weekly reading assignments.</i>	4-6 (studies refer to use with grade 5)	Tier 2, Moderate What Works Clearinghouse Intervention Report: Vocabulary Improvement Program for English Language Learners and Their Classmates (ed.gov)