

Minutes
Historical Preservation and Landmark Board of Review
Virtual Special Meeting
Sept. 9, 2020, 4:00 p.m.
WebEx, Virtual Special Meeting

A meeting notice had been given and an agenda was posted in accordance with the Open Meeting Act.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Kassy Malone
Mike Mays
Susan McCalmont
Carla Spaniard
Laura Stone

MEMBERS ABSENT: Sharon Astrin
Dr. Andreana Prichard

STAFF/GUESTS: Casey Jones, AICP, OMES, Planner
Beverly Hicks, OMES, Planning/Administrative Coordinator
Bob Burton, Applicant
Ryan Brown, U Build It
Tim Ross, Applicant
Glen Than, Build It
Reverend Donna Moore, Applicant
Renita Pettigrew, Applicant representative
Frank V. Roesler III, ODOT Virtual Meetings
Corbi Jenkins, ODOT VM

A. Roll Call:

Chairwoman Laura Stone called the meeting to order at 4:03 p.m. A roll call was taken and a quorum was established. Ms. Stone was advised that notice of the meeting had been given and an agenda posted in accordance with the Open Meeting Act.

This meeting took place in lieu of the September 3, 2020, regular scheduled video conference special meeting, due to the lack of a quorum.

B. Minutes:

1. Approval, disapproval or amendment of the minutes of the August 6, 2020, special meeting:

Mike Mays moved to approve the special meeting minutes of August. Carla Spaniard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Ms. Spaniard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

C. Special Public Hearings: None.

D. **Rezoning Requests:** None.

E. **Certificates of Appropriateness:**

1. **Discussion and possible action regarding CA-20-21-7, request by Robert Burton, Blue Bob Operations, LLC, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a detached garage at 901 NE 21st Street in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:**

Staff recommended to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to revisions, with the following findings and conditions:

Findings:

- a. The proposed garage is comparable in size and placement to the existing garage, has a modest design, and does not convey a false sense of historical development.
- b. The location, building footprint, scale, orientation, design and exterior materials of the proposed garage are compatible with the property's setting and with buildings on nearby properties.
- c. The proposed garage will not have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the district or property.

Recommended conditions:

- a. The entry door on the west elevation of the garage shall be a solid wood door.
- b. The lap siding shall have an exposed width (reveal) not greater than 7 inches.
- c. All exterior work shall conform to the approved site plan, architectural elevation drawings, and exterior material specifications. Changes to the approved plans must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.

Carla Splaingard moved to approve incorporating staff recommendation. Susan McCalmont seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

2. **Discussion and possible action regarding CA-20-21-9, request by Rev. Donna Moore for a Certificate of Appropriateness for replacement of 36 windows on the home with Quaker Brighton Series single hung aluminum-clad wood windows at 903 NE 16th Street in the Lincoln Terrace East Historic District of Oklahoma City:**

The existing windows on the home have a mix of divided light patterns. The prominent elevations are the south and west sides of the home. The east side of the home is not visible from 16th Street. The north elevation of the home is partially visible from the street at an angle.

The applicant proposes to replace 36 windows and install windows with a 1-over-6 pattern on the south and west sides, and a 1-over-1 pattern on the north and east sides of the home. On the south and north sides, which are the front and the rear sides of the home, six windows each on those elevations would be replaced, and on the east and west elevations of the home, twelve windows each on those elevations would be replaced.

Staff recommended to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to revisions, with the following findings and conditions:

Findings:

- a. The proposed work is designed to be compatible with the existing structure and will not have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the district or the property.

Recommended conditions:

- a. Plans shall be revised and submitted to staff to provide divided light patterns that match the historic patterns of the windows on the home, with the majority of the windows having a 6-over-6 pattern.
- b. All exterior work shall conform to the approved plans and window specifications. Changes to the approved plans must be submitted to commission staff for review and approval prior to making changes on site.

Currently, the windows on the home are a mix of divided light patterns, which brought some discussion and debate on the true historic patterns of the windows. Staff clarified that the historic pattern that was most likely present on the majority of the windows was the 6-over-6 pattern. Staff's recommendation is to match the historic pattern mostly likely present, with the majority being 6-over-6, and to maintain the 8-over-8 and 4-over-4 patterns that are present on the south elevation front of the home, while maintaining the 6-over-6 on the other elevations. The Board asked staff to work with the applicant on each elevation to determine the pattern of each window or window set.

Carla Splaingard moved to approve the window replacement with the product the applicant has provided, using a muntin pattern, with muntins on top and bottom regardless of the location, on all elevations. The applicant will work with staff to determine the muntin pattern, whether it is an 8-over-8, 4-over-4 or a 6-over-6, with muntins on both top and bottom sashes. Susan McCalmont seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Astrin, yes; Ms. Malone, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Dr. Prichard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding CA-19-20-47, request by Ryan Brown, UBuildIt, representing 429 NE 15th LLC, the owner, for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior work at 429 NE 15th Street in the Wilson-Harn Historic District of Oklahoma City:

This item was tabled on August 6, 2020, and the Board requested the applicant provide interior photos of the existing single family dwelling and an engineer's report. On August 28, 2020 the applicant submitted the requested information to staff.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for items listed below in Item a.1 and Item b.2.

- a. **Item 1, demolition of a single family dwelling, carport, storage shed and driveway.**

The engineer's report validated that the building is not structurally sound and recommended not doing any new construction or remodeling on the existing foundation. This is due to some foundation failure, portions of the existing foundation not having been constructed to current code, and the thickness of the foundation not being adequate to support the load of the building. The photos provided by the applicant and presented by staff give evidence to the report.

Staff recommended to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition work listed in Item 1, with the following findings:

Findings:

- a. The structure is in a state of disrepair and requires extensive work.
- b. While demolition of the structure will damage the integrity and continuity of the district, repairing the structure could result in the loss of the structure's historic fabric.

Mike Mays moved to approve demolition. Carla Splaingard seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

b. Item 2, construction of a single family dwelling, detached garage, driveway and fence.

The proposed new dwelling on the front elevation of the home is two story with a one story detached garage located behind it. The siting of the buildings will approximate the siting of adjacent buildings and will be consistent with the scale and placement of surrounding homes in the neighborhood.

The existing home is set back over one hundred feet from the front property line. The proposed dwelling will match the setback of the homes on either side, being more compatible in pattern, massing, and scale. The concrete driveway will be eight feet wide, located on the east side of the home, leading back to the garage. The garage will be a two car detached garage.

Staff recommended to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction as submitted in Item 2, with the following findings and conditions:

Findings:

- a. The proposed work is designed to be compatible with surrounding structures and will not have an adverse effect on the integrity and historic character of the district.

Conditions:

- a. Exterior brick shall not be painted.

- b. All exterior work shall conform to the approved site plan, architectural elevation drawings, and exterior material specifications.
- c. New concrete shall not be bright white in color. Color-matching the concrete to older, existing concrete is encouraged.

The Board raised questions on the window sizes/shapes and the window sliders located on the top second story elevation. The elevation drawing shown to board members, showed the windows being 1-over-1. Staff clarified that the windows of the home will be 6-over-1 on all elevations. The applicant representative stated that two second floor slider windows will be 6x6, with six divided lights on each side.

The board expressed that they would like for the windows to be a 6-over-6 pattern with visible muntins on the outside and inside that are consistent with the historic neighborhood and were not in favor of the slider windows located on the front and east elevations. The board requested that the applicant provide an updated elevation that shows divided light within the windows (can be hand sketched over a CAD drawing) for the board to compare and make a more informed decision. The applicant representative stated that he could furnish the members with two or three different elevations and based on their decision will move forward.

Mike Mays moved to table this item until more detailed elevations are provided. Susan McCalmont seconded the motion. The following votes were recorded and the motion passed:

Ms. Malone, yes; Mr. Mays, yes; Ms. McCalmont, yes; Ms. Splaingard, yes; Ms. Stone, yes.

F. Miscellaneous: None.

G. Reports and Communications: None.

H. Adjournment:

There being no further business, Carla Splaingard motioned to adjourn. Susan McCalmont seconded the motion. Seeing no opposition, the meeting adjourned at 5:12p.m.